

Message

From: Cathy Tortorici - NOAA Federal [cathy.tortorici@noaa.gov]
Sent: 11/1/2019 6:53:10 PM
To: Suarez, Mark [Suarez.Mark@epa.gov]
CC: Nesci, Kimberly [Nesci.Kimberly@epa.gov]; Miller, Wynne [Miller.Wynne@epa.gov]; Keigwin, Richard [Keigwin.Richard@epa.gov]; Echeverria, Marietta [Echeverria.Marietta@epa.gov]; Anderson, Brian [Anderson.Brian@epa.gov]
Subject: Re: Bromoxynil and Prometryn extended SUUMs

Mark -

Thanks so much for this.

Cathy T.

On Fri, Nov 1, 2019 at 1:26 PM Suarez, Mark <Suarez.Mark@epa.gov> wrote:

Cathy,

Please find attached the Bromoxynil and Prometryn extended SUUMs. These reports include the state level usage estimates (Table 2) from the proprietary data source, as NMFS has requested.

We have looked over NMFS' preliminary review of the state level Malathion usage data. It is our intention to provide more comprehensive comments on the methodology used in the analysis, but we have some initial impressions and comments for your consideration:

Ex. 5 Deliberative Process (DP)

Ex. 5 Deliberative Process (DP)

Ex. 5 Deliberative Process (DP)

Please let me know if you have any question about our initial concerns. We are available to discuss these data and the NMFS validation analysis in greater detail once you have received our full comments on the analysis method.

Regards,

Mark

Mark Suarez

Senior Scientist

Science Information and Analysis Branch

Biological and Economic Analysis Division

US EPA (Mail Code 7503P)

1200 Pennsylvania Avenue, NW

Washington, DC 20460

phone: 703-305-0120

--

Cathy Tortorici
Chief, ESA Interagency Cooperation Division

Office of Protected Resources
NOAA's National Marine Fisheries Service
1315 East-West Highway
Silver Spring, MD 20910
(w) 301.427.8495
(c) 301.602.2193
cathy.tortorici@noaa.gov

Message

From: Ryan DeWitt - NOAA Affiliate [ryan.dewitt@noaa.gov]
Sent: 5/13/2019 3:42:02 PM
To: Suarez, Mark [Suarez.Mark@epa.gov]
CC: Perry, Tracy [Perry.Tracy@epa.gov]; cathy.tortorici@noaa.gov; Thomas Hooper - NOAA Federal [thomas.hooper@noaa.gov]; Tony Hawkes - NOAA Federal [tony.hawkes@noaa.gov]; David Baldwin - NOAA Federal [david.baldwin@noaa.gov]; Nesci, Kimberly [Nesci.Kimberly@epa.gov]; Anderson, Neil [Anderson.Neil@epa.gov]
Subject: Re: FW: SUUM report - internal deliberative?

Mark

Thanks for looking into the questions we had, and also for inquiring about the California AMRD data. Regarding the updated SUUM: yes, we would prefer the updated numbers (2013-2017) so long as they are readily available. Do you anticipate needing additional time to produce an updated SUUM?

Thanks,
Ryan

On Thu, May 9, 2019 at 1:35 PM Suarez, Mark <Suarez.Mark@epa.gov> wrote:

Ryan,

We are putting together the clarifications that you requested previously, as well as considering your request for the AMRD data for CA. I expect to provide both clarifications addressing your questions and a determination regarding the CA level AMRD data early next week.

Also, we are working on completing the revised SUUM for bromoxynil. We have been working to revise it, not update it. Please, let me know if you would prefer updated usage numbers (i.e., 2013-2017 instead of 2012-2016).

Regards,

Mark

Mark Suarez

Senior Scientist

Science Information and Analysis Branch

Biological and Economic Analysis Division

US EPA (Mail Code 7503P)

1200 Pennsylvania Avenue, NW

Washington, DC 20460

phone: 703-305-0120

From: Ryan DeWitt - NOAA Affiliate <ryan.dewitt@noaa.gov>
Sent: Wednesday, May 08, 2019 12:08 PM
To: Suarez, Mark <Suarez.Mark@epa.gov>
Cc: Perry, Tracy <Perry.Tracy@epa.gov>; cathy.tortorici@noaa.gov; Thomas Hooper - NOAA Federal <thomas.hooper@noaa.gov>; Tony Hawkes - NOAA Federal <tony.hawkes@noaa.gov>; David Baldwin - NOAA Federal <david.baldwin@noaa.gov>
Subject: Re: FW: SUUM report - internal deliberative?

Hi Mark,

Thanks for being available for questions on the SUUM reports. I had previously asked Diann a few questions on the existing reports. Are you able to provide clarification on these? I've copied those questions below (in Blue).

Also, we noticed that the SUUM reports for bromoxynil and prometryn do not include the AMRD estimates for California. We agree that the CALDPR data more accurately represents past use than the AMRD estimates. However, we would still like to see those estimates so that we can make comparisons and better understand the reliability of the usage information in the SUUM. Are you able to provide us with the California AMRD estimates?

Thanks again!

Previous questions:

The prometryn SUUM uses the phrase "not surveyed" and "not surveyed at state level" in table 2. Can these be interpreted to mean the same thing as "not surveyed at national level"?

For bromoxynil, a few approved uses do not appear in the SUUM (industrial sites, rights-of-way, conservation reserve program). Would it be accurate to indicate “not surveyed at national level” for these uses?

Also, I noticed what might be a couple of typos in the PCT reported for Bromoxynil (table 2). Can you provided clarification for these? For barley in WA, the reported average (0.3) is lower than the reported minimum (43.6). For alfalfa in OR, the reported minimum (0.6) is higher than the reported maximum (0.0).

On Tue, May 7, 2019 at 6:22 AM Nesci, Kimberly <Nesci.Kimberly@epa.gov> wrote:

Dear Ryan,

Thank you for your follow-up note to Diann Sims on the release of the SUUMs. Diann is away from BEAD on a detail and I am in the process of filing her position with an Acting BC. In the interim, I am writing to follow up on your question below.

As Diann mentioned, during the last couple ESA Pesticide Senior Managers Calls (Thursday, 8:00 am meetings), we discussed your request to highlight portions of the SUUMs and append the entire SUUMs to your BiOps as reference documents.

Ex. 5 Deliberative Process (DP)

Ex. 5 Deliberative Process (DP)

After we hear back with Cathy on our request, let's discuss publicly releasable SUUMs. The publicly releasable SUUMs will differ slightly from the internal/deliberative document in that some data will be masked in order to protect the confidentiality of our data providers, as well as any propriety data.

If you have any questions on this, please contact Mark Suarez, a Senior Scientist in Diann's branch who is copied on this message. I will follow up with Cathy during the Thursday morning calls as well (and I've copied her on this message). Thank you for reaching out.

Best,

Kimberly

Kimberly Nesci, Acting Director

Biological and Economic Analysis Division (BEAD)

Office of Pesticide Programs

Office of Chemical Safety and Pollution Prevention

703-308-8059

From: Ryan DeWitt - NOAA Affiliate <ryan.dewitt@noaa.gov>

Sent: Monday, April 29, 2019 11:40 AM

To: Sims, Diann <Sims.Diann@epa.gov>

Subject: Re: SUUM report - internal deliberative?

Hi Diann,

Things got a little busy around here and I forgot to check back in until now - did you find out anything regarding our releasing the SUUM reports as part of the 2019 BiOP?

Thanks - hope you had a nice weekend,

Ryan

On Mon, Apr 8, 2019 at 2:59 PM Sims, Diann <Sims.Diann@epa.gov> wrote:

Hi Ryan,

We're happy to help. I need to check in with senior managers about publishing the documents. I think they plan to discuss at Thursday morning's meeting. So, I'll get back to you right after.

From: Ryan DeWitt - NOAA Affiliate <ryan.dewitt@noaa.gov>
Sent: Thursday, April 4, 2019 5:13 PM
To: Sims, Diann <Sims.Diann@epa.gov>
Cc: cathy.tortorici@noaa.gov; Thomas Hooper - NOAA Federal <thomas.hooper@noaa.gov>; Tony Hawkes - NOAA Federal <tony.hawkes@noaa.gov>; David Baldwin - NOAA Federal <david.baldwin@noaa.gov>
Subject: SUUM report - internal deliberative?

Hi Diann,

Thanks again for compiling the national and state use and usage summaries for prometryn and bromoxynil. As you know, we are currently working on the biological opinions for these two compounds, which are due December 31 of this year.

We noticed that the prometryn SUUM contains the header: "Internal deliberative; not for use beyond the Interagency ESA workshop" and that similarly the bromoxynil SUUM contains the header: "EPA internal, deliberative document – Not for distribution beyond the Federal Interagency Workgroup".

We would like to include these summaries in our Opinions but we are uncertain, given the headers, if there are limitations on what all information can be made public. Ideally we would like to highlight certain pieces of information and then append the entire reports for reference. Is this possible?

Thanks,

Ryan DeWitt

--

Ryan DeWitt

Contractor with Ocean Associates, Inc.

National Marine Fisheries Service

Office of Protected Resources

510 Desmond Drive SE Suite 103

Lacey, WA 98503

Telephone: (360) 753-9595

ryan.dewitt@noaa.gov

--

Ryan DeWitt

Contractor with Ocean Associates, Inc.

National Marine Fisheries Service

Office of Protected Resources

510 Desmond Drive SE Suite 103

Lacey, WA 98503

Telephone: (360) 753-9595

ryan.dewitt@noaa.gov

--

Ryan DeWitt

Contractor with Ocean Associates, Inc.

National Marine Fisheries Service

Office of Protected Resources

510 Desmond Drive SE Suite 103

Lacey, WA 98503

Telephone: (360) 753-9595

ryan.dewitt@noaa.gov

--

Ryan DeWitt
Contractor with Ocean Associates, Inc.
National Marine Fisheries Service
Office of Protected Resources
510 Desmond Drive SE Suite 103
Lacey, WA 98503

Telephone: (360) 753-9595
ryan.dewitt@noaa.gov

Message

From: Ryan DeWitt - NOAA Affiliate [ryan.dewitt@noaa.gov]
Sent: 5/23/2019 3:05:39 PM
To: Suarez, Mark [Suarez.Mark@epa.gov]
Subject: Re: FW: SUUM report - internal deliberative?

Thanks Mark

On Thu, May 23, 2019 at 5:00 AM Suarez, Mark <Suarez.Mark@epa.gov> wrote:

Ryan,

My apologies. I was out of the office unexpectedly and have been playing catchup on a number of issues.

We will provide the updated SUUM with the most recent data. Expect the document within the next few of weeks.

The AMRD state level data for CA are more complicated issue, as you are aware. I expect to have an answer to you by Friday.

Regards,

Mark

From: Ryan DeWitt - NOAA Affiliate <ryan.dewitt@noaa.gov>
Sent: Monday, May 20, 2019 6:26 PM
To: Suarez, Mark <Suarez.Mark@epa.gov>
Cc: Perry, Tracy <Perry.Tracy@epa.gov>; cathy.tortorici@noaa.gov; Thomas Hooper - NOAA Federal <thomas.hooper@noaa.gov>; Tony Hawkes - NOAA Federal <tony.hawkes@noaa.gov>; David Baldwin - NOAA Federal <david.baldwin@noaa.gov>; Nesci, Kimberly <Nesci.Kimberly@epa.gov>; Anderson, Neil <Anderson.Neil@epa.gov>
Subject: Re: FW: SUUM report - internal deliberative?

Hi Mark,

Just checking in on whether you have heard anything regarding the SUMM clarifications and also the availability of the California AMRD data. Do you think it is possible to get resolution on these topics sometime this week?

Thanks!
Ryan

On Mon, May 13, 2019 at 8:42 AM Ryan DeWitt - NOAA Affiliate <ryan.dewitt@noaa.gov> wrote:

Mark

Thanks for looking into the questions we had, and also for inquiring about the California AMRD data. Regarding the updated SUUM: yes, we would prefer the updated numbers (2013-2017) so long as they are readily available. Do you anticipate needing additional time to produce an updated SUUM?

Thanks,

Ryan

On Thu, May 9, 2019 at 1:35 PM Suarez, Mark <Suarez.Mark@epa.gov> wrote:

Ryan,

We are putting together the clarifications that you requested previously, as well as considering your request for the AMRD data for CA. I expect to provide both clarifications addressing your questions and a determination regarding the CA level AMRD data early next week.

Also, we are working on completing the revised SUUM for bromoxynil. We have been working to revise it, not update it. Please, let me know if you would prefer updated usage numbers (i.e., 2013-2017 instead of 2012-2016).

Regards,

Mark

Mark Suarez

Senior Scientist

Science Information and Analysis Branch

Biological and Economic Analysis Division

US EPA (Mail Code 7503P)

1200 Pennsylvania Avenue, NW

Washington, DC 20460

phone: 703-305-0120

From: Ryan DeWitt - NOAA Affiliate <ryan.dewitt@noaa.gov>

Sent: Wednesday, May 08, 2019 12:08 PM

To: Suarez, Mark <Suarez.Mark@epa.gov>

Cc: Perry, Tracy <Perry.Tracy@epa.gov>; cathy.tortorici@noaa.gov; Thomas Hooper - NOAA Federal <thomas.hooper@noaa.gov>; Tony Hawkes - NOAA Federal <tony.hawkes@noaa.gov>; David Baldwin - NOAA Federal <david.baldwin@noaa.gov>

Subject: Re: FW: SUUM report - internal deliberative?

Hi Mark,

Thanks for being available for questions on the SUUM reports. I had previously asked Diann a few questions on the existing reports. Are you able to provide clarification on these? I've copied those questions below (in Blue).

Also, we noticed that the SUUM reports for bromoxynil and prometryn do not include the AMRD estimates for California. We agree that the CALDPR data more accurately represents past use than the AMRD estimates. However, we would still like to see those estimates so that we can make comparisons and better understand the reliability of the usage information in the SUUM. Are you able to provide us with the California AMRD estimates?

Thanks again!

Previous questions:

The prometryn SUUM uses the phrase “not surveyed” and “not surveyed at state level” in table 2. Can these be interpreted to mean the same thing as “not surveyed at national level”?

For bromoxynil, a few approved uses do not appear in the SUUM (industrial sites, rights-of-way, conservation reserve program). Would it be accurate to indicate “not surveyed at national level” for these uses?

Also, I noticed what might be a couple of typos in the PCT reported for Bromoxynil (table 2). Can you provide clarification for these? For barley in WA, the reported average (0.3) is lower than the reported minimum (43.6). For alfalfa in OR, the reported minimum (0.6) is higher than the reported maximum (0.0).

On Tue, May 7, 2019 at 6:22 AM Nesci, Kimberly <Nesci.Kimberly@epa.gov> wrote:

Dear Ryan,

Thank you for your follow-up note to Diann Sims on the release of the SUUMs. Diann is away from BEAD on a detail and I am in the process of filing her position with an Acting BC. In the interim, I am writing to follow up on your question below.

As Diann mentioned, during the last couple ESA Pesticide Senior Managers Calls (Thursday, 8:00 am meetings), we discussed your request to highlight portions of the SUUMs and append the entire SUUMs to your BiOps as reference documents.

Ex. 5 Deliberative Process (DP)

Ex. 5 Deliberative Process (DP)

After we hear back with Cathy on our request, let's discuss publicly releasable SUUMs. The publicly releasable SUUMs will differ slightly from the internal/deliberative document in that some data will be masked in order to protect the confidentiality of our data providers, as well as any proprietary data.

If you have any questions on this, please contact Mark Suarez, a Senior Scientist in Diann's branch who is copied on this message. I will follow up with Cathy during the Thursday morning calls as well (and I've copied her on this message). Thank you for reaching out.

Best,

Kimberly

Kimberly Nesci, Acting Director

Biological and Economic Analysis Division (BEAD)

Office of Pesticide Programs

Office of Chemical Safety and Pollution Prevention

703-308-8059

From: Ryan DeWitt - NOAA Affiliate <ryan.dewitt@noaa.gov>

Sent: Monday, April 29, 2019 11:40 AM

To: Sims, Diann <Sims.Diann@epa.gov>

Subject: Re: SUUM report - internal deliberative?

Hi Diann,

Things got a little busy around here and I forgot to check back in until now - did you find out anything regarding our releasing the SUUM reports as part of the 2019 BiOP?

Thanks - hope you had a nice weekend,

Ryan

On Mon, Apr 8, 2019 at 2:59 PM Sims, Diann <Sims.Diann@epa.gov> wrote:

Hi Ryan,

We're happy to help. I need to check in with senior managers about publishing the documents. I think they plan to discuss at Thursday morning's meeting. So, I'll get back to you right after.

From: Ryan DeWitt - NOAA Affiliate <ryan.dewitt@noaa.gov>

Sent: Thursday, April 4, 2019 5:13 PM

To: Sims, Diann <Sims.Diann@epa.gov>

Cc: cathy.tortorici@noaa.gov; Thomas Hooper - NOAA Federal <thomas.hooper@noaa.gov>; Tony Hawkes - NOAA Federal <tony.hawkes@noaa.gov>; David Baldwin - NOAA Federal <david.baldwin@noaa.gov>

Subject: SUUM report - internal deliberative?

Hi Diann,

Thanks again for compiling the national and state use and usage summaries for prometryn and bromoxynil. As you know, we are currently working on the biological opinions for these two compounds, which are due December 31 of this year.

We noticed that the prometryn SUUM contains the header: "Internal deliberative; not for use beyond the Interagency ESA workshop" and that similarly the bromoxynil SUUM contains the header: "EPA internal, deliberative document – Not for distribution beyond the Federal Interagency Workgroup".

We would like to include these summaries in our Opinions but we are uncertain, given the headers, if there are limitations on what all information can be made public. Ideally we would like to highlight certain pieces of information and then append the entire reports for reference. Is this possible?

Thanks,

Ryan DeWitt

--

Ryan DeWitt

Contractor with Ocean Associates, Inc.

National Marine Fisheries Service

Office of Protected Resources

510 Desmond Drive SE Suite 103

Lacey, WA 98503

Telephone: (360) 753-9595

ryan.dewitt@noaa.gov

--

Ryan DeWitt

Contractor with Ocean Associates, Inc.

National Marine Fisheries Service

Office of Protected Resources

510 Desmond Drive SE Suite 103

Lacey, WA 98503

Telephone: (360) 753-9595

ryan.dewitt@noaa.gov

--

Ryan DeWitt

Contractor with Ocean Associates, Inc.

National Marine Fisheries Service

Office of Protected Resources

510 Desmond Drive SE Suite 103

Lacey, WA 98503

Telephone: (360) 753-9595

ryan.dewitt@noaa.gov

--

Ryan DeWitt

Contractor with Ocean Associates, Inc.

National Marine Fisheries Service

Office of Protected Resources

510 Desmond Drive SE Suite 103

Lacey, WA 98503

Telephone: (360) 753-9595

ryan.dewitt@noaa.gov

--

Ryan DeWitt

Contractor with Ocean Associates, Inc.

National Marine Fisheries Service

Office of Protected Resources

510 Desmond Drive SE Suite 103

Lacey, WA 98503

Telephone: (360) 753-9595

ryan.dewitt@noaa.gov

--

Ryan DeWitt

Contractor with Ocean Associates, Inc.

National Marine Fisheries Service

Office of Protected Resources

510 Desmond Drive SE Suite 103

Lacey, WA 98503

Telephone: (360) 753-9595

ryan.dewitt@noaa.gov

Message

From: Suarez, Mark [/O=EXCHANGELABS/OU=EXCHANGE ADMINISTRATIVE GROUP (FYDIBOHF23SPDLT)/CN=RECIPIENTS/CN=9BDB9158F4B245F8969069AC019D4F13-MARK E SUAREZ]
Sent: 1/23/2020 1:53:27 PM
To: Nesci, Kimberly [Nesci.Kimberly@epa.gov]; Johnson, Hope [johnson.hope@epa.gov]
Subject: From B&P BiOp

9.2.7.3 Pesticide Usage

Ex. 5 Deliberative Process (DP)

Ex. 5 Deliberative Process (DP)

Regards,
Mark

Mark Suarez
Senior Scientist
Science Information and Analysis Branch
Biological and Economic Analysis Division
US EPA (Mail Code 7503P)
1200 Pennsylvania Avenue, NW
Washington, DC 20460

phone: 703-305-0120

Message

From: Suarez, Mark [/O=EXCHANGELABS/OU=EXCHANGE ADMINISTRATIVE GROUP (FYDIBOHF23SPDLT)/CN=RECIPIENTS/CN=9BDB9158F4B245F8969069AC019D4F13-MARK E SUAREZ]
Sent: 5/24/2019 5:58:06 PM
To: Ryan DeWitt - NOAA Affiliate [ryan.dewitt@noaa.gov]
CC: Perry, Tracy [Perry.Tracy@epa.gov]; cathy.tortorici@noaa.gov; Thomas Hooper - NOAA Federal [thomas.hooper@noaa.gov]; Tony Hawkes - NOAA Federal [tony.hawkes@noaa.gov]; David Baldwin - NOAA Federal [david.baldwin@noaa.gov]; Nesci, Kimberly [Nesci.Kimberly@epa.gov]; Anderson, Neil [Anderson.Neil@epa.gov]
Subject: RE: FW: SUUM report - internal deliberative?

Hello Ryan,

Data quality is a concern that we all share. My understanding is that the Agency has previously presented our data quality standards to the Services. If it would be helpful, I can provide those materials again. Additionally, the Agency has evaluated the proprietary data (AMRD) and determined that the data meet our data quality standards. In addition to meeting the quality standards, the AMRD are the best usage data available for most surveyed crops, nationally and in most states.

Providing the averaged, rounded AMRD for CA is not in and of itself problematic, we have provided it for all of the other states. Presumably, in estimating validity, you would like to compare the CalPUR data to the AMRD and measure the error. My concern is that comparisons of AMRD and CalPUR data averaged values without any additional context is potentially misleading. Any evaluation of AMRD data validity should be more than a comparison of one 5-year average of total pounds applied against another 5-year average of total pounds applied. Factors such as the sample size for the state (both the sample number for the pesticide type (e.g., insecticides) in a state for a crop and the number of respondents in a state that used the pesticide of interest (e.g., malathion)) within a year and the differences on an annual basis are important pieces of information for the analysis. We cannot provide the underlying data necessary for an analysis with this level of detail and I do not anticipate being able to adequately explain any differences that may be observed between data sources due to contractual restrictions on the level of detail we may disclose for data obtained from proprietary sources. Therefore, we will not be providing the AMRD CA state level data at this time.

If you can provide an analytical strategy that you believe would be appropriate for evaluating the validity of the AMRD usage data as we are able to provide them (i.e., averaged and rounded) and propose an acceptable level of error, we would be open discussing the method, the error level, and a reevaluation of this position.

Regards,
Mark

Mark Suarez
Senior Scientist
Science Information and Analysis Branch
Biological and Economic Analysis Division
US EPA (Mail Code 7503P)
1200 Pennsylvania Avenue, NW
Washington, DC 20460

phone: 703-305-0120

From: Ryan DeWitt - NOAA Affiliate <ryan.dewitt@noaa.gov>
Sent: Monday, May 20, 2019 6:26 PM

To: Suarez, Mark <Suarez.Mark@epa.gov>

Cc: Perry, Tracy <Perry.Tracy@epa.gov>; cathy.tortorici@noaa.gov; Thomas Hooper - NOAA Federal <thomas.hooper@noaa.gov>; Tony Hawkes - NOAA Federal <tony.hawkes@noaa.gov>; David Baldwin - NOAA Federal <david.baldwin@noaa.gov>; Nesci, Kimberly <Nesci.Kimberly@epa.gov>; Anderson, Neil <Anderson.Neil@epa.gov>

Subject: Re: FW: SUUM report - internal deliberative?

Hi Mark,

Just checking in on whether you have heard anything regarding the SUMM clarifications and also the availability of the California AMRD data. Do you think it is possible to get resolution on these topics sometime this week?

Thanks!

Ryan

On Mon, May 13, 2019 at 8:42 AM Ryan DeWitt - NOAA Affiliate <ryan.dewitt@noaa.gov> wrote:

Mark

Thanks for looking into the questions we had, and also for inquiring about the California AMRD data. Regarding the updated SUUM: yes, we would prefer the updated numbers (2013-2017) so long as they are readily available. Do you anticipate needing additional time to produce an updated SUUM?

Thanks,

Ryan

On Thu, May 9, 2019 at 1:35 PM Suarez, Mark <Suarez.Mark@epa.gov> wrote:

Ryan,

We are putting together the clarifications that you requested previously, as well as considering your request for the AMRD data for CA. I expect to provide both clarifications addressing your questions and a determination regarding the CA level AMRD data early next week.

Also, we are working on completing the revised SUUM for bromoxynil. We have been working to revise it, not update it. Please, let me know if you would prefer updated usage numbers (i.e., 2013-2017 instead of 2012-2016).

Regards,

Mark

Mark Suarez

Senior Scientist

Science Information and Analysis Branch

Biological and Economic Analysis Division

US EPA (Mail Code 7503P)

1200 Pennsylvania Avenue, NW

Washington, DC 20460

phone: 703-305-0120

From: Ryan DeWitt - NOAA Affiliate <ryan.dewitt@noaa.gov>

Sent: Wednesday, May 08, 2019 12:08 PM

To: Suarez, Mark <Suarez.Mark@epa.gov>

Cc: Perry, Tracy <Perry.Tracy@epa.gov>; cathy.tortorici@noaa.gov; Thomas Hooper - NOAA Federal <thomas.hooper@noaa.gov>; Tony Hawkes - NOAA Federal <tony.hawkes@noaa.gov>; David Baldwin - NOAA Federal <david.baldwin@noaa.gov>

Subject: Re: FW: SUUM report - internal deliberative?

Hi Mark,

Thanks for being available for questions on the SUUM reports. I had previously asked Diann a few questions on the existing reports. Are you able to provide clarification on these? I've copied those questions below (in Blue).

Also, we noticed that the SUUM reports for bromoxynil and prometryn do not include the AMRD estimates for California. We agree that the CALDPR data more accurately represents past use than the AMRD estimates. However, we would still like to see those estimates so that we can make comparisons and better understand the reliability of the usage information in the SUUM. Are you able to provide us with the California AMRD estimates?

Thanks again!

Previous questions:

The prometryn SUUM uses the phrase "not surveyed" and "not surveyed at state level" in table 2. Can these be interpreted to mean the same thing as "not surveyed at national level"?

For bromoxynil, a few approved uses do not appear in the SUUM (industrial sites, rights-of-way, conservation reserve program). Would it be accurate to indicate “not surveyed at national level” for these uses?

Also, I noticed what might be a couple of typos in the PCT reported for Bromoxynil (table 2). Can you provided clarification for these? For barley in WA, the reported average (0.3) is lower than the reported minimum (43.6). For alfalfa in OR, the reported minimum (0.6) is higher than the reported maximum (0.0).

On Tue, May 7, 2019 at 6:22 AM Nesci, Kimberly <Nesci.Kimberly@epa.gov> wrote:

Dear Ryan,

Thank you for your follow-up note to Diann Sims on the release of the SUUMs. Diann is away from BEAD on a detail and I am in the process of filing her position with an Acting BC. In the interim, I am writing to follow up on your question below.

As Diann mentioned, during the last couple ESA Pesticide Senior Managers Calls (Thursday, 8:00 am meetings), we discussed your request to highlight portions of the SUUMs and append the entire SUUMs to your BiOps as reference documents.

Ex. 5 Deliberative Process (DP)

Ex. 5 Deliberative Process (DP)

After we hear back with Cathy on our request, let's discuss publicly releasable SUUMs. The publicly releasable SUUMs will differ slightly from the internal/deliberative document in that some data will be masked in order to protect the confidentiality of our data providers, as well as any propriety data.

If you have any questions on this, please contact Mark Suarez, a Senior Scientist in Diann's branch who is copied on this message. I will follow up with Cathy during the Thursday morning calls as well (and I've copied her on this message). Thank you for reaching out.

Best,

Kimberly

Kimberly Nesci, Acting Director

Biological and Economic Analysis Division (BEAD)

Office of Pesticide Programs

Office of Chemical Safety and Pollution Prevention

703-308-8059

From: Ryan DeWitt - NOAA Affiliate <ryan.dewitt@noaa.gov>

Sent: Monday, April 29, 2019 11:40 AM

To: Sims, Diann <Sims.Diann@epa.gov>

Subject: Re: SUUM report - internal deliberative?

Hi Diann,

Things got a little busy around here and I forgot to check back in until now - did you find out anything regarding our releasing the SUUM reports as part of the 2019 BiOP?

Thanks - hope you had a nice weekend,

Ryan

On Mon, Apr 8, 2019 at 2:59 PM Sims, Diann <Sims.Diann@epa.gov> wrote:

Hi Ryan,

We're happy to help. I need to check in with senior managers about publishing the documents. I think they plan to discuss at Thursday morning's meeting. So, I'll get back to you right after.

From: Ryan DeWitt - NOAA Affiliate <ryan.dewitt@noaa.gov>

Sent: Thursday, April 4, 2019 5:13 PM

To: Sims, Diann <Sims.Diann@epa.gov>

Cc: cathy.tortorici@noaa.gov; Thomas Hooper - NOAA Federal <thomas.hooper@noaa.gov>; Tony Hawkes - NOAA Federal <tony.hawkes@noaa.gov>; David Baldwin - NOAA Federal <david.baldwin@noaa.gov>

Subject: SUUM report - internal deliberative?

Hi Diann,

Thanks again for compiling the national and state use and usage summaries for prometryn and bromoxynil. As you know, we are currently working on the biological opinions for these two compounds, which are due December 31 of this year.

We noticed that the prometryn SUUM contains the header: "Internal deliberative; not for use beyond the Interagency ESA workshop" and that similarly the bromoxynil SUUM contains the header: "EPA internal, deliberative document – Not for distribution beyond the Federal Interagency Workgroup".

We would like to include these summaries in our Opinions but we are uncertain, given the headers, if there are limitations on what all information can be made public. Ideally we would like to highlight certain pieces of information and then append the entire reports for reference. Is this possible?

Thanks,

Ryan DeWitt

--

Ryan DeWitt

Contractor with Ocean Associates, Inc.

National Marine Fisheries Service

Office of Protected Resources

510 Desmond Drive SE Suite 103

Lacey, WA 98503

Telephone: (360) 753-9595

ryan.dewitt@noaa.gov

--

Ryan DeWitt

Contractor with Ocean Associates, Inc.

National Marine Fisheries Service

Office of Protected Resources

510 Desmond Drive SE Suite 103

Lacey, WA 98503

Telephone: (360) 753-9595

ryan.dewitt@noaa.gov

--

Ryan DeWitt

Contractor with Ocean Associates, Inc.

National Marine Fisheries Service

Office of Protected Resources

510 Desmond Drive SE Suite 103

Lacey, WA 98503

Telephone: (360) 753-9595

ryan.dewitt@noaa.gov

--

Ryan DeWitt
Contractor with Ocean Associates, Inc.
National Marine Fisheries Service
Office of Protected Resources
510 Desmond Drive SE Suite 103
Lacey, WA 98503

Telephone: (360) 753-9595

ryan.dewitt@noaa.gov

--

Ryan DeWitt
Contractor with Ocean Associates, Inc.
National Marine Fisheries Service
Office of Protected Resources
510 Desmond Drive SE Suite 103
Lacey, WA 98503

Telephone: (360) 753-9595

ryan.dewitt@noaa.gov

Message

From: Suarez, Mark [/O=EXCHANGELABS/OU=EXCHANGE ADMINISTRATIVE GROUP (FYDIBOHF23SPDLT)/CN=RECIPIENTS/CN=9BDB9158F4B245F8969069AC019D4F13-MARK E SUAREZ]
Sent: 5/23/2019 12:00:25 PM
To: Ryan DeWitt - NOAA Affiliate [ryan.dewitt@noaa.gov]
CC: Perry, Tracy [Perry.Tracy@epa.gov]; cathy.tortorici@noaa.gov; Thomas Hooper - NOAA Federal [thomas.hooper@noaa.gov]; Tony Hawkes - NOAA Federal [tony.hawkes@noaa.gov]; David Baldwin - NOAA Federal [david.baldwin@noaa.gov]; Nesci, Kimberly [Nesci.Kimberly@epa.gov]; Anderson, Neil [Anderson.Neil@epa.gov]
Subject: RE: FW: SUUM report - internal deliberative?

Ryan,

My apologies. I was out of the office unexpectedly and have been playing catchup on a number of issues. We will provide the updated SUUM with the most recent data. Expect the document within the next few of weeks. The AMRD state level data for CA are more complicated issue, as you are aware. I expect to have an answer to you by Friday.

Regards,
Mark

From: Ryan DeWitt - NOAA Affiliate <ryan.dewitt@noaa.gov>
Sent: Monday, May 20, 2019 6:26 PM
To: Suarez, Mark <Suarez.Mark@epa.gov>
Cc: Perry, Tracy <Perry.Tracy@epa.gov>; cathy.tortorici@noaa.gov; Thomas Hooper - NOAA Federal <thomas.hooper@noaa.gov>; Tony Hawkes - NOAA Federal <tony.hawkes@noaa.gov>; David Baldwin - NOAA Federal <david.baldwin@noaa.gov>; Nesci, Kimberly <Nesci.Kimberly@epa.gov>; Anderson, Neil <Anderson.Neil@epa.gov>
Subject: Re: FW: SUUM report - internal deliberative?

Hi Mark,

Just checking in on whether you have heard anything regarding the SUMM clarifications and also the availability of the California AMRD data. Do you think it is possible to get resolution on these topics sometime this week?

Thanks!
Ryan

On Mon, May 13, 2019 at 8:42 AM Ryan DeWitt - NOAA Affiliate <ryan.dewitt@noaa.gov> wrote:

Mark

Thanks for looking into the questions we had, and also for inquiring about the California AMRD data. Regarding the updated SUUM: yes, we would prefer the updated numbers (2013-2017) so long as they are readily available. Do you anticipate needing additional time to produce an updated SUUM?

Thanks,
Ryan

On Thu, May 9, 2019 at 1:35 PM Suarez, Mark <Suarez.Mark@epa.gov> wrote:

Ryan,

We are putting together the clarifications that you requested previously, as well as considering your request for the AMRD data for CA. I expect to provide both clarifications addressing your questions and a determination regarding the CA level AMRD data early next week.

Also, we are working on completing the revised SUUM for bromoxynil. We have been working to revise it, not update it. Please, let me know if you would prefer updated usage numbers (i.e., 2013-2017 instead of 2012-2016).

Regards,

Mark

Mark Suarez

Senior Scientist

Science Information and Analysis Branch

Biological and Economic Analysis Division

US EPA (Mail Code 7503P)

1200 Pennsylvania Avenue, NW

Washington, DC 20460

phone: 703-305-0120

From: Ryan DeWitt - NOAA Affiliate <ryan.dewitt@noaa.gov>

Sent: Wednesday, May 08, 2019 12:08 PM

To: Suarez, Mark <Suarez.Mark@epa.gov>

Cc: Perry, Tracy <Perry.Tracy@epa.gov>; cathy.tortorici@noaa.gov; Thomas Hooper - NOAA Federal <thomas.hooper@noaa.gov>; Tony Hawkes - NOAA Federal <tony.hawkes@noaa.gov>; David Baldwin - NOAA Federal <david.baldwin@noaa.gov>

Subject: Re: FW: SUUM report - internal deliberative?

Hi Mark,

Thanks for being available for questions on the SUUM reports. I had previously asked Diann a few questions on the existing reports. Are you able to provide clarification on these? I've copied those questions below (in Blue).

Also, we noticed that the SUUM reports for bromoxynil and prometryn do not include the AMRD estimates for California. We agree that the CALDPR data more accurately represents past use than the AMRD estimates. However, we would still like to see those estimates so that we can make comparisons and better understand the reliability of the usage information in the SUUM. Are you able to provide us with the California AMRD estimates?

Thanks again!

Previous questions:

The prometryn SUUM uses the phrase "not surveyed" and "not surveyed at state level" in table 2. Can these be interpreted to mean the same thing as "not surveyed at national level"?

For bromoxynil, a few approved uses do not appear in the SUUM (industrial sites, rights-of-way, conservation reserve program). Would it be accurate to indicate "not surveyed at national level" for these uses?

Also, I noticed what might be a couple of typos in the PCT reported for Bromoxynil (table 2). Can you provided clarification for these? For barley in WA, the reported average (0.3) is lower than the reported minimum (43.6). For alfalfa in OR, the reported minimum (0.6) is higher than the reported maximum (0.0).

On Tue, May 7, 2019 at 6:22 AM Nesci, Kimberly <Nesci.Kimberly@epa.gov> wrote:

Dear Ryan,

Thank you for your follow-up note to Diann Sims on the release of the SUUMs. Diann is away from BEAD on a detail and I am in the process of filing her position with an Acting BC. In the interim, I am writing to follow up on your question below.

As Diann mentioned, during the last couple ESA Pesticide Senior Managers Calls (Thursday, 8:00 am meetings), we discussed your request to highlight portions of the SUUMs and append the entire SUUMs to your BiOps as reference documents.

Ex. 5 Deliberative Process (DP)

Ex. 5 Deliberative Process (DP)

Ex. 5 Deliberative Process (DP)

After we hear back with Cathy on our request, let's discuss publicly releasable SUUMs. The publicly releasable SUUMs will differ slightly from the internal/deliberative document in that some data will be masked in order to protect the confidentiality of our data providers, as well as any propriety data.

If you have any questions on this, please contact Mark Suarez, a Senior Scientist in Diann's branch who is copied on this message. I will follow up with Cathy during the Thursday morning calls as well (and I've copied her on this message). Thank you for reaching out.

Best,

Kimberly

Kimberly Nesci, Acting Director

Biological and Economic Analysis Division (BEAD)

Office of Pesticide Programs

Office of Chemical Safety and Pollution Prevention

703-308-8059

From: Ryan DeWitt - NOAA Affiliate <ryan.dewitt@noaa.gov>

Sent: Monday, April 29, 2019 11:40 AM

To: Sims, Diann <Sims.Diann@epa.gov>

Subject: Re: SUUM report - internal deliberative?

Hi Diann,

Things got a little busy around here and I forgot to check back in until now - did you find out anything regarding our releasing the SUUM reports as part of the 2019 BiOP?

Thanks - hope you had a nice weekend,

Ryan

On Mon, Apr 8, 2019 at 2:59 PM Sims, Diann <Sims.Diann@epa.gov> wrote:

Hi Ryan,

We're happy to help. I need to check in with senior managers about publishing the documents. I think they plan to discuss at Thursday morning's meeting. So, I'll get back to you right after.

From: Ryan DeWitt - NOAA Affiliate <ryan.dewitt@noaa.gov>

Sent: Thursday, April 4, 2019 5:13 PM

To: Sims, Diann <Sims.Diann@epa.gov>

Cc: cathy.tortorici@noaa.gov; Thomas Hooper - NOAA Federal <thomas.hooper@noaa.gov>; Tony Hawkes - NOAA Federal <tony.hawkes@noaa.gov>; David Baldwin - NOAA Federal <david.baldwin@noaa.gov>

Subject: SUUM report - internal deliberative?

Hi Diann,

Thanks again for compiling the national and state use and usage summaries for prometryn and bromoxynil. As you know, we are currently working on the biological opinions for these two compounds, which are due December 31 of this year.

We noticed that the prometryn SUUM contains the header: "Internal deliberative; not for use beyond the Interagency ESA workshop" and that similarly the bromoxynil SUUM contains the header: "EPA internal, deliberative document – Not for distribution beyond the Federal Interagency Workgroup".

We would like to include these summaries in our Opinions but we are uncertain, given the headers, if there are limitations on what all information can be made public. Ideally we would like to highlight certain pieces of information and then append the entire reports for reference. Is this possible?

Thanks,

Ryan DeWitt

--

Ryan DeWitt

Contractor with Ocean Associates, Inc.

National Marine Fisheries Service

Office of Protected Resources

510 Desmond Drive SE Suite 103

Lacey, WA 98503

Telephone: (360) 753-9595

ryan.dewitt@noaa.gov

--

Ryan DeWitt

Contractor with Ocean Associates, Inc.

National Marine Fisheries Service

Office of Protected Resources

510 Desmond Drive SE Suite 103

Lacey, WA 98503

Telephone: (360) 753-9595

ryan.dewitt@noaa.gov

--

Ryan DeWitt

Contractor with Ocean Associates, Inc.

National Marine Fisheries Service

Office of Protected Resources

510 Desmond Drive SE Suite 103

Lacey, WA 98503

Telephone: (360) 753-9595

ryan.dewitt@noaa.gov

--

Ryan DeWitt

Contractor with Ocean Associates, Inc.

National Marine Fisheries Service

Office of Protected Resources

510 Desmond Drive SE Suite 103

Lacey, WA 98503

Telephone: (360) 753-9595

ryan.dewitt@noaa.gov

--

Ryan DeWitt

Contractor with Ocean Associates, Inc.

National Marine Fisheries Service

Office of Protected Resources

510 Desmond Drive SE Suite 103

Lacey, WA 98503

Telephone: (360) 753-9595

ryan.dewitt@noaa.gov

Message

From: Suarez, Mark [/O=EXCHANGELABS/OU=EXCHANGE ADMINISTRATIVE GROUP (FYDIBOHF23SPDLT)/CN=RECIPIENTS/CN=9BDB9158F4B245F8969069AC019D4F13-MARK E SUAREZ]
Sent: 5/9/2019 8:35:10 PM
To: Ryan DeWitt - NOAA Affiliate [ryan.dewitt@noaa.gov]
CC: Perry, Tracy [Perry.Tracy@epa.gov]; cathy.tortorici@noaa.gov; Thomas Hooper - NOAA Federal [thomas.hooper@noaa.gov]; Tony Hawkes - NOAA Federal [tony.hawkes@noaa.gov]; David Baldwin - NOAA Federal [david.baldwin@noaa.gov]; Nesci, Kimberly [Nesci.Kimberly@epa.gov]; Anderson, Neil [Anderson.Neil@epa.gov]
Subject: RE: FW: SUUM report - internal deliberative?

Ryan,

We are putting together the clarifications that you requested previously, as well as considering your request for the AMRD data for CA. I expect to provide both clarifications addressing your questions and a determination regarding the CA level AMRD data early next week.

Also, we are working on completing the revised SUUM for bromoxynil. We have been working to revise it, not update it. Please, let me know if you would prefer updated usage numbers (i.e., 2013-2017 instead of 2012-2016).

Regards,
Mark

Mark Suarez
Senior Scientist
Science Information and Analysis Branch
Biological and Economic Analysis Division
US EPA (Mail Code 7503P)
1200 Pennsylvania Avenue, NW
Washington, DC 20460

phone: 703-305-0120

From: Ryan DeWitt - NOAA Affiliate <ryan.dewitt@noaa.gov>
Sent: Wednesday, May 08, 2019 12:08 PM
To: Suarez, Mark <Suarez.Mark@epa.gov>
Cc: Perry, Tracy <Perry.Tracy@epa.gov>; cathy.tortorici@noaa.gov; Thomas Hooper - NOAA Federal <thomas.hooper@noaa.gov>; Tony Hawkes - NOAA Federal <tony.hawkes@noaa.gov>; David Baldwin - NOAA Federal <david.baldwin@noaa.gov>
Subject: Re: FW: SUUM report - internal deliberative?

Hi Mark,

Thanks for being available for questions on the SUUM reports. I had previously asked Diann a few questions on the existing reports. Are you able to provide clarification on these? I've copied those questions below (in Blue).

Also, we noticed that the SUUM reports for bromoxynil and prometryn do not include the AMRD estimates for California. We agree that the CALDPR data more accurately represents past use than the AMRD estimates. However, we would still like to see those estimates so that we can make comparisons and better understand the reliability of the usage information in the SUUM. Are you able to provide us with the California AMRD estimates?

Thanks again!

Previous questions:

The prometryn SUUM uses the phrase “not surveyed” and “not surveyed at state level” in table 2. Can these be interpreted to mean the same thing as “not surveyed at national level”?

For bromoxynil, a few approved uses do not appear in the SUUM (industrial sites, rights-of-way, conservation reserve program). Would it be accurate to indicate “not surveyed at national level” for these uses?

Also, I noticed what might be a couple of typos in the PCT reported for Bromoxynil (table 2). Can you provided clarification for these? For barley in WA, the reported average (0.3) is lower than the reported minimum (43.6). For alfalfa in OR, the reported minimum (0.6) is higher than the reported maximum (0.0).

On Tue, May 7, 2019 at 6:22 AM Nesci, Kimberly <Nesci.Kimberly@epa.gov> wrote:

Dear Ryan,

Thank you for your follow-up note to Diann Sims on the release of the SUUMs. Diann is away from BEAD on a detail and I am in the process of filing her position with an Acting BC. In the interim, I am writing to follow up on your question below.

As Diann mentioned, during the last couple ESA Pesticide Senior Managers Calls (Thursday, 8:00 am meetings), we discussed your request to highlight portions of the SUUMs and append the entire SUUMs to your BiOps as reference documents.

Ex. 5 Deliberative Process (DP)

Ex. 5 Deliberative Process (DP)

After we hear back with Cathy on our request, let’s discuss publicly releasable SUUMs. The publicly releasable SUUMs will differ slightly from the internal/deliberative document in that some data will be masked in order to protect the confidentiality of our data providers, as well as any propriety data.

If you have any questions on this, please contact Mark Suarez, a Senior Scientist in Diann’s branch who is copied on this message. I will follow up with Cathy during the Thursday morning calls as well (and I’ve copied her on this message). Thank you for reaching out.

Best,

Kimberly

Kimberly Nesci, Acting Director

Biological and Economic Analysis Division (BEAD)

Office of Pesticide Programs

Office of Chemical Safety and Pollution Prevention

703-308-8059

From: Ryan DeWitt - NOAA Affiliate <ryan.dewitt@noaa.gov>

Sent: Monday, April 29, 2019 11:40 AM

To: Sims, Diann <Sims.Diann@epa.gov>

Subject: Re: SUUM report - internal deliberative?

Hi Diann,

Things got a little busy around here and I forgot to check back in until now - did you find out anything regarding our releasing the SUUM reports as part of the 2019 BiOP?

Thanks - hope you had a nice weekend,

Ryan

On Mon, Apr 8, 2019 at 2:59 PM Sims, Diann <Sims.Diann@epa.gov> wrote:

Hi Ryan,

We're happy to help. I need to check in with senior managers about publishing the documents. I think they plan to discuss at Thursday morning's meeting. So, I'll get back to you right after.

From: Ryan DeWitt - NOAA Affiliate <ryan.dewitt@noaa.gov>

Sent: Thursday, April 4, 2019 5:13 PM

To: Sims, Diann <Sims.Diann@epa.gov>

Cc: cathy.tortorici@noaa.gov; Thomas Hooper - NOAA Federal <thomas.hooper@noaa.gov>; Tony Hawkes - NOAA Federal <tony.hawkes@noaa.gov>; David Baldwin - NOAA Federal <david.baldwin@noaa.gov>

Subject: SUUM report - internal deliberative?

Hi Diann,

Thanks again for compiling the national and state use and usage summaries for prometryn and bromoxynil. As you know, we are currently working on the biological opinions for these two compounds, which are due December 31 of this year.

We noticed that the prometryn SUUM contains the header: "Internal deliberative; not for use beyond the Interagency ESA workshop" and that similarly the bromoxynil SUUM contains the header: "EPA internal, deliberative document – Not for distribution beyond the Federal Interagency Workgroup".

We would like to include these summaries in our Opinions but we are uncertain, given the headers, if there are limitations on what all information can be made public. Ideally we would like to highlight certain pieces of information and then append the entire reports for reference. Is this possible?

Thanks,

Ryan DeWitt

--

Ryan DeWitt

Contractor with Ocean Associates, Inc.

National Marine Fisheries Service

Office of Protected Resources

510 Desmond Drive SE Suite 103

Lacey, WA 98503

Telephone: (360) 753-9595

ryan.dewitt@noaa.gov

--

Ryan DeWitt

Contractor with Ocean Associates, Inc.

National Marine Fisheries Service

Office of Protected Resources

510 Desmond Drive SE Suite 103

Lacey, WA 98503

Telephone: (360) 753-9595

ryan.dewitt@noaa.gov

--

Ryan DeWitt

Contractor with Ocean Associates, Inc.

National Marine Fisheries Service

Office of Protected Resources

510 Desmond Drive SE Suite 103

Lacey, WA 98503

Telephone: (360) 753-9595

ryan.dewitt@noaa.gov